Do I take it all or do I borrow only what I need?
The impact of financial education courses on student loan borrowing decisions

Catherine P. Montalto, Ph.D., Associate Professor, Consumer Sciences, College of Education and Human Ecology
Anne McDaniel, Ph.D., Associate Director of Research and Data Management, Center for the Study of Student Life

The Ohio State University
STUDY ON

Collegiate Financial Wellness
Previous Research

• Student loans as a vehicle for increasing access to higher education
  Avery & Turner 2012; Dwyer, McCloud & Hobson 2012

• Student loan repayment behavior
  Gross, Cekic, Hossler & Hillman 2009; Hillman 2014
  • Important of degree completion
  • Impact of amount borrowed

• Impact of student loan debt on additional education, family formation, home ownership, career choice
  Addo 2014; Andrew 2007
Guidelines for Student Loan Borrowing

• Estimate the full cost of college
  • Tuition and fees, housing and living expenses, books and supplies
• Identify all resources available to pay college expenses
  • Family contributions, scholarships and grants, savings, wages
• Borrow only what you need!

http://www.usnews.com/education/best‐colleges/paying‐for‐college/articles/2012/08/13/6‐steps‐to‐determine‐how‐much‐to‐borrow‐for‐college

https://www.discover.com/student‐loans/college‐planning/estimate‐loan‐amount.html
Purpose

• The 2014 Study on Collegiate Financial Wellness* is used to investigate how financial education classes are related to students’ borrowing decisions

• We explore whether these patterns are different for first generation students

*Formerly titled National Student Financial Wellness Study
Research Questions

• What factors do students consider when deciding how much money to borrow for the school year?

• Do students make borrowing decisions on their own, or use other information?

• Is financial education associated with these decisions?
Sample

• College students enrolled at 4-year public and 4-year private institutions who are using student loans

• Analysis of complete cases

• Sample size: 7,180 college students
Description of Sample

- **Average age:** 24
- **68%** female, **32%** male
- **Race/ethnicity**
  - **75%** White
  - **11%** Other races
  - **5%** Black
  - **6%** Hispanic
  - **3%** Asian
- **SES**
  - Low: **20%**
  - Middle: **24%**
  - High: **27%**
  - Don’t know: **22%**
  - Preferred not to say: **7%**
- **Years enrolled**
  - First year: **14%**
  - Second year: **18%**
  - Third year: **21%**
  - Fourth year: **23%**
  - Fifth year or more: **24%**
- **Institution Type**
  - **89%** 4-year public
  - **11%** 4-year private
- **Financial dependent:** **56%**
- **Nontraditional:** **34%**
- **First generation:** **48%**
First generation students do not differ from non-first generation students in receiving financial education.

Low SES students are less likely to receive only HS financial education but more likely to receive only college financial education.

High SES students are more likely to receive financial education in both high school and college.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Borrow the maximum amount available in my package, regardless of the amount</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use my budget and borrow only what I think I will need</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Try to borrow as little as possible</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider the total amount of debt I will graduate with</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider the amounts I have borrowed in the past</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First generation students are more likely to borrow the maximum amount available in their package (31%)
When deciding how much money I will need to borrow for the school year, I: (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Decide on my own how much I will need to borrow</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consult with a parent, guardian, or family member to determine how much I will need to borrow</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consult with a financial aid counselor to determine how much I will need to borrow</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use information obtained from the internet to determine how much I will need to borrow</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First generation students are more likely to make decisions on their own (64%)
Multivariate Analysis

• Logistic regression

• Separate analysis for each of the five approaches to determining amount to borrow and each of the four information sources

• Primary interest in impact of financial education

• Models control for age, sex, race/ethnicity, financial dependent status, first generation status, citizenship status, nontraditional status, class rank, GPA, financial knowledge score, institution type, socioeconomic status, and employment status
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Budget</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Future</th>
<th>Past</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>+ Female</td>
<td>-Female</td>
<td>+Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race/Ethnicity</td>
<td>+ Black</td>
<td>-Black</td>
<td>-Hispanic</td>
<td>-Hispanic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First generation</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial dependent</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nontraditional</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPA</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial knowledge</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four-year private</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable</td>
<td>Own</td>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>Counselor</td>
<td>Internet</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>-Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race/Ethnicity</td>
<td>-White</td>
<td>+White</td>
<td>-White</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First generation</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial dependent</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nontraditional</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPA</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td>( -)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial knowledge</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>( -)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>( +)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four-year private</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Findings – Amount Borrowed

• Compared to students with no financial education in high school or college, students who complete financial education classes are:
  – Less likely to borrow the maximum amount ($p<.001$)
  – More likely to use their budget and borrow what they need ($p<.001$)
  – More likely to try to borrow as little as possible ($p<.10$)
  – More likely to consider the total amount of debt at graduation ($p<.10$)
Findings – Information Sources

• Compared to students with no financial education in high school or college, students who complete financial education classes are:
  – More likely to consult parents \( (p<.05) \) when making borrowing decisions
  – More likely to consult financial aid counselors \( (p<.001) \) when making borrowing decisions
  – More likely to use information obtained from the internet \( (p<.001) \) when making borrowing decisions
Findings – First Generation

- Compared to non-first generation students, first generation college students who receive financial education are:
  - More likely to consider amounts borrowed in the past when making borrowing decisions ($p < .05$)
  - Less likely to decide on their own ($p < .1$) and more likely to consult parents/family ($p < .05$) when deciding how much to borrow
Summary

• Evidence of association between financial education and
  – The factors students consider when deciding how much money to borrow for the school year
  – The information sources used by students when making borrowing

• Evidence of some differences among first generation students
Prevalence of financial education

- 29% of respondents reported taking financial education classes in high school.
- 24% of respondents reported taking financial education classes in college.
- 57% of respondents reported receiving no financial education.
Discussion

How do we implement financial education when students come to us with varying background knowledge?

How do we target education toward first generation students?

- Current practices
- Recommendations for interventions
- Cautions/Lessons learned
STUDY ON

Collegiate Financial Wellness

Sign up by September 1 at cfw.osu.edu
or email scfw@osu.edu for more information
Questions?
Montalto.2@osu.edu
McDaniel.145@osu.edu
References


